

DOI: 10.7596/taksad.v6i4.1167

Citation: Stankevich, E., Khanova, A., & Gallyamov, F. (2017). Modeling of Consciences Image "Government / Elite" by Tatars and Russians (Evidence from of the Republic of Tatarstan). *Journal of History Culture and Art Research*, 6(4), 1268-1275. doi:<http://dx.doi.org/10.7596/taksad.v6i4.1167>

Modeling of Consciences Image "Government / Elite" by Tatars and Russians (Evidence from of the Republic of Tatarstan)

Ekaterina A. Stankevich¹, Aigul F. Khanova², Filus G. Gallyamov³

Abstract

In this article inter-ethnic tension in government sphere is detected. Consideration of the concept of inter-ethnic tension from the position of psycholinguistics provides additional material for a comprehensive study of this issue, an attempt is made to diagnose inter-ethnic tensions in a particular region - the Republic of Tatarstan. As stimulus - word was taken the following group: Ethno-social representations associated with public notions: *pravitel'stvo/hökümät-government/elite*. Psycholinguistics (ethno-psycholinguistics), which deals with the problem of representation of the systemic nature of the linguistic consciousness of native speakers of different cultures, puts forward the associative experiment as the main method. The material of the study is an array of associates, which we obtained as a result of a free associative experiment in Russian and Tatar languages. We placed our research on the Internet site <http://virtualexs.ru>. The experiment was conducted in 2015 and 2016. Analyzing the data obtained during the free associative experiment, we come to the conclusion that the situation between the title and non-title ethnic group is not ethnically tense. We can predict: if the effectiveness of the state national policy remains at the same low level, inter-ethnic tension in society will grow, and the geography of conflicts will expand.

Keywords: Inter-ethnic tension, Government, Elite, Linguistic consciousness, Free associative experiment, The Republic of Tatarstan, Stimulus-word, Word associative test.

¹ Kazan Federal University, Elabuga Institute of KFU. E-mail: katy-stankevich@yandex.ru

² Kazan Federal University, Naberezhnochelninsky Institute of KFU.

³ Kazan Federal University, Elabuga Institute of KFU.

Introduction

Topicality is determined by the necessity to study the characteristics of inter-ethnic contacts and intercultural communication of various ethnic groups living in the same territory. The goal of research is to verbally diagnose inter-ethnic tension by examining the array of associates obtained in a free associative experiment, representatives of the Tatar and Russian ethnic groups living in the Republic of Tatarstan. The experiment was conducted in two state languages: Tatar and Russian. The target of our research is linguistic consciousness of representatives of the most numerous ethnic groups living in the Republic of Tatarstan, i.e. Tatars and Russians.

As stimulus-word, we selected lexical items representing some ethno-social notions in which, according to sociological studies, interethnic tension can be represented.

Materials and methods

Psycholinguistics (ethno-psycholinguistics), dealing with the problem of representation of the systemic nature of linguistic consciousness of native speakers of different cultures, puts forward as the main method an associative experiment. The principle of this method is that ethno-social representations that make up the content of ethnic identity are fixed in the constitutional mental formations - conventional stereotypes, specifically represented in the language (Adamova, 2005). The material of the study is an group of associates, which is obtained as a result of a free associative experiment. The general scheme of the associative experiment is as follows: the subject is presented with the stimulus word, which is required to give the first associations that came to mind. 198 people took part in our experiment: 90 people were surveyed in 2015, 43 of them were Russian nationals (48%), 42 representatives of Tatar nationality (47%) and 5 representatives of other nationalities (5%); In 2016, a survey was compiled and conducted in the Tatar language, in which 108 representatives of the Tatar nationality participated. Russian test participants: the age ranges: 17 – 45 years, (M 22, SD 6). Tatar test participants: the age ranges 18 – 57 years, (M 23, SD 11). Tatar test participants in 2016: the age ranges 17 – 68 years, (M 30, SD 13). The reactions are presented in the form of an associative field. According to N.V. Ufimtseva, the associative field, obtained as a result of an associative experiment, is not only a fragment of the human verbal memory, but also a fragment of the image of the world of an ethnos reflected in the consciousness of the "medium" speaker of a culture, its motives, evaluations, and, consequently, its cultural stereotypes (Ufimtseva, 2011).

In modern studies of the psycholinguistic orientation, the method of the semantic gestalt of Y.N. Karaulov is used to analyze the results obtained in the course of associative experiments. For a comparative study of the national and cultural specifics of linguistic consciousness of different ethnic groups, Karaulov suggests using a "semantic gestalt", a structure that reflects the "images" of the national cultural world, imprinted in their native language. The semantic Gestalt of the associative field is one way of representing knowledge of the world around us in the linguistic consciousness of the speakers of a language (Karaulov, 2000). The semantic Gestalt is compiled on the basis of the semantic classification of associates (reactions) entering into the associative field of a given stimulus, and consists of several semantic zones. Each zone is a "characteristic of some essential feature, of which the intensional of a given stimulus, the generalized image of a part of the world behind the given word, is composed" (Karaulov, 2000).

We follow Y.N. Karaulov and distinguish semantic zones such as:

- 1) The concepts
- 2) The images
- 3) Emotional attitude
- 4) Your / other's
- 5) Other

Results

Consequently, the following associative field was given to the word "Pravitel'stvo (government)" by people of the Republic of Tatarstan in the analysis of reaction: Putin (Putin) - 4, upravlenie (administration)- 2, zakon (law)- 2, partiya (public association), korrupcija (jobbery), vlast' (governance), vorjugi (brocks), darmoedy (useless eaters), bezdel'niki (idlers), moshenniki (swindlers), svolochi (rascals), bestolochi (featherhead), pozor (shame), umy (minds), organ upravlenija (governing board), narod (nation), politika (policy), ljudi (people), strana (country) and etc.

The structure of the associative value, obtained as a result of the second stage of the analysis, is as follows: concepts - 13 (32.5%), images - 10 (25%), emotional attitude - 16 (40%), your/others - 1 (2.5%).

Consequently, the following association area was given to the word "chökümät (government)" by Tatar respondents in the analysis of reaction: bashlyklar utyra torgan açir däülät (state) - 11, bashlyk (leader) - 6, Minnehanov (Minnehanov) - 5, akcha (money) - 4, il

(country) - 3, Tatarstan (Tatarstan) - 2, ak jort (The White House) - 2, hakimijat (government) - 2, bashkala (capital) - 2, deputat (deputy) - 2, Putin (Putin) - 4, dörec bulmagan politika (wrong policy), tarafynnan (on someone's position), Shajmiev (Shajmiev), kötsch (strength), kyrys (severe), mär (mayor), zhitäkschelek itü (administration), jesh (work), millät (nation), bashlyklar utyra torgan zhir (place for leaders), idarä itütsche (leader), Värit Möchämmätschin (Farit Muhammetshin), deputatlar zhyelmacy (meeting of deputies) and etc. The structure of the associative value obtained as a result of the second stage of the analysis: concepts - 25 (32%), images - 36 (46%), emotional attitude - 17 (22%).

We should mention, data that were given in the analysis of materials in Russian and Tatar are different. According to E. Hobsbaum, ethnic identity is a prepared way of expressing the real meaning of group identity, which links the group members, that is, "us", to emphasize the difference from "them" (Hobsbawn, 1992). In structural relation the semantic elements of associated meaning in Russian language the associations that show the emotional attitude dominate, such as (R – vorjugi (brocks), darmoedy (useless eaters), bezdel'niki (idlers), nagloe (insolent), glupye (stupid), moshenniki (swindlers), pokazuha (eye-service), svolochi (rascals), bestolochi (featherhead), pozor (shame), while in Tatar language, the emotional attitude presents minor percent and there are the following associations (R - dörec bulmagan politika (wrong policy), chalyk ötschen tügel (not for people), chökümätkä yschanmyjm (I don't believe government), jugary (the highest rank), jaklauchy (lazy). As we see, these associations by Russian and Tatar people are words with negative connotation. The modern administrative and political elite does not meet the qualitative criteria and requirements imposed on the elite layer.

We would especially like to note the semantic zone of "The images" to stimulus-word "Chökümät (Government)", that has larger percentage of the other components. This semantic zone reflects individual representations associated with this stimulus word, as we see in this case with specific individuals (R - Minnehanov (Minnehanov), Khalikov (Khalikov), Shajmiev (Shajmiev), Putin (Putin). The semantic connection between the image of the government and the elements of its political activity is also evident.

As the results of our study showed, the general ideas expressed by the associates express the different ideas about the government. As E.D. Makarova notices, the modern administrative and political elite does not meet the qualitative criteria and requirements imposed on the elite layer. The images of the existing power are different from its standard representations. The citizen's nationality is very important for the entry into the republican elite (Makarova, 2010). This position is also confirmed by the research conducted within the framework of the grant by Russian Humanitarian Scientific Foundation "Civil, regional and ethnic identity and

problems of integration of Russian society", because according to the results of the survey, Russians are more likely than Tatars to be sure that their nationality will make it difficult to move up in the professional, power and business spheres. On the contrary, at least 70% of the Tatars considered that their ethnicity does not affect the opportunities for promotion in this or that area. So the structure and content of the conventional stereotype "Pravitel'stvo /chökümät (government)" did not reveal the component "national elite", "nationalism".

As a result of the analysis of the reactions of the population of Tatarstan to the word-stimulus "Jelita (Elite)" on the material of the Russian language, the following associative field was obtained: vysshij sloj (aristocracy) - 5, bogatyj (rich) - 3, klass (class) - 2, vlast' (power) - 2, zoloto (gold), glamur (glamour), bandity (bandits), shelka (silk fabrics), licemerie (hypocrisy), vysokomerie (assumption) and etc. The structure of the associative value obtained as a result of the second stage of the analysis is as follows: concepts - 10 (24%), image - 18 (43%), emotional attitudes - 13 (31%), your/others - (2%).

As a result of the analysis of the reactions of the subjects to the word-stimulus "Jelita (Elite)" on the material of the Tatar language, the following associative field was given: Bajlar (*rich people*) - 8, bajlyk (*riches*)- 7, akcha (*money*) - 5, intelligencija (*professional class*) - 5, matur (*beautiful*) - 4, avtoritetly keschelär (*prominent figures*) - 4, däräzhälek (*degree*) - 4, hakimijat (*governance*)- 2, keschelär (*people*) - 2, in jachschy (*the best*) - 2, jugary däräzhä (*sonorous titles*) - 2, дусларым (*my friends*), besdä jelitanyn iceme genä (*our elite is only a name*), kyjbatly (*expensive*), mafija (*organized crime*), mashina (*car*), selekcija (*selection*), аерым keschelär (*certain people*), belemle keschelär (*well-informed people*), jugary belemle keschelär (*men of great scholarship*), jugary belemle türelär (*official of great scholarship*) and etc. The structure of the associative value obtained as a result of the second stage of the analysis: concepts - 10 (12%), images - 22 (26%), emotional attitude - 51 (60%), other - 2 (2%).

We should mention the structure that was given in the result of reactions by Russians and Tatars differs slightly, but there are some variances.

To the stimulus - word "Jelita (Elite)", the Russian test persons received more reactions pertaining to the semantic zone of "Images", whereas a larger percentage of the Tatars' reactions belong to the semantic zone "Emotional Attitude". Common images include such reactions as (R- fatirlar (flats), galimnär (scientists), mädäniyat chesmätkärläre (employees in the area of culture), schähär (town) and etc.). The semantic zone "Emotional attitude" is more evident in the reactions of Tatars, such as (R – *jelitanyn iceme genä* (elite is only a name), kyjbatly (expensive), syjfatly (qualitative), jaratu (love), zhitäktshelär (leaders), jugary (the highest rank), akyly keshe (a clever person), kötütschelär, jugaryda utyruchylar

(administration), *jugary keschelär* (administration), *kin taralğan* (widespread), *jugary därezhädäge keschelär* (people with sonorous titles), *zur keschelär* (respectable persons), *jugary säwyk* (sapience), *ukymyshly kemelär* (men of education).

The semantic zone "emotional attitude" is presented to a lesser extent in Russian and is expressed by such reactions as (R– *bogatyj* (rich), *glamur* (glamour), *osobnyye* (individuals), *luchshij* (the best), *roskosh'* (luxury), *nenastojashhaja* (unreal), *licemerie* (dissimulation), *bydlo* (lowbrow), *vysokomerie* (assumption), *prevoshodstvo* (excellence), *mazhorik* (rich kid). Also we should mention the semantic zone "Other" which is revealed in the analysis of the reaction given by the Tatar respondents: R - *Tatarlar alğa* (Tatars forward), *bez buldyrabyz* (We can do it).

As we see, reactions have some differences, but do not contain lexemes with negative connotations in Russian and Tatar associative fields, as it was represented in reactions to stimulus-word "Pravitel'stvo (government)". However, as E.D. Makarova in the study "The image of the administrative and political elite through the eyes of the population of the Republic of Tatarstan" confirms, the attitude of citizens to the administrative and political elites and the system of power is very inertial (Makarova, 2010). One of the pressing problems is the formation of the corps of government officials, and especially the administrative and political elite, which would prioritize the interests of the development of society or at least seek to coordinate with them their own interests (Makarova, 2010).

So it's necessary to cover the new applied directions in linguistics, as *linguo-propaedeutics* and from the view point of such authors as Zamaletdinov, Karabulatova, Yarmakeev, Ermakova, the *ethno-linguo-propaedeutics* can solve the stabilization problems in complex poly-ethnic regions. Separate moments of the studied problem were reflected to some extent in the works of culture experts, sociologists, philosophers, philologists, psychologists and pedagogues. Modern *ethno-linguo-propaedeutics* are based on the attempt to shift gradually from the position of *ethno-centrism* to *cultural relativism*. The main content of *cultural relativism* can be formulated in the form of the following thesis: "All cultures are different, but they are equal", with the meaning, that your own cultural norms, values, traditions are not better or worse, than the others, and the others are not better or worse than your own (Zamaletdinov et al., 2014).

Conclusion

Analyzing the data obtained during the free associative experiment, we come to the conclusion that the situation is not ethnically tense, which is especially evident in the areas of governance and power. It is in these spheres the presence of reactions with negative

connotation is frequency-related, but the absence of associations representing the titular and non-titular ethnic groups actualizes a low degree of tension in the spheres of power and administration.

As for the image of power and elite, in the opinion of Svetlana Ryzhova, a leading researcher of the department of ethnic sociology of the Center for the Study of Interethnic Relations of the Institute of Sociology of the Russian Academy of Sciences, the representation of Russians in government bodies decreased in Tatarstan (Center for the Study of Interethnic Relations, 2017). There have been changes in proportions in the spheres of public administration and business: the ratio is steadily changing in favor of representatives of the titular ethnos. At the same time, Center for National Conflict Studies stresses that the protest moods in Russia are often caused by socio-economic problems, imperfection of the political system, corruption, but expressed in the form of nationalism, including radicalism. We can predict: if the effectiveness of the state national policy remains at an equally low level, inter-ethnic tensions in society will grow, and the geography of conflicts will expand (New day, 2014). On the one hand, by initiating conflict along ethnic lines, elites can deepen ethnic division and thus increase polarization (Horowitz, 2000). But on the other hand, public authorities and all social actors are invited to develop intercultural dialogue in the spaces of everyday life and in the framework of the respect of fundamental freedoms. There are an unlimited number of possibilities for creating such spaces (Council of Europe, 2008). We should mention that in the activities of elites aiming at spreading modern national consciousness, history has been a key instrument. The development of national consciousness has assumed the development of the uniform historical consciousness, enabling all members of a national community to participate in what Edward Shils calls, a central system of group values (Shils, 1982).

Generally speaking, attempts to prevent ethnic violence should pay considerable attention to the role of the elite. Promising ways to achieve this would be to reduce elites' incentive or ability to reduce trust. This is especially important in cases where the elite may attempt to do so because they are threatened by a high level of trust. In such cases, the interests of the elite diverge from those of society overall, since the elite values being in power more than possible gains from trade (Alder & Wang, 2014).

Acknowledgements

The work is performed according to the Russian Government Program of Competitive Growth of Kazan Federal University.

References

- Adamova, Z. G. (2005). Modeling of the autostereotype "Yakut" / "Sakhalan" on the material of the associative experiment. *Bulletin of the North-Eastern Federal University*, 88-94.
- Alder, S. & Wang, Y. (2014). *Divide and Rule: An Origin of Polarization and Ethnic Conflict*. University of Zurich.
- Center for the Study of Interethnic Relations (2017). Retrieved on 15.06.2017 from <http://club-rf.ru/thegrapesofwrath/01/>
- Council of Europe (2008). White Paper on Intercultural Dialogue "Living Together As Equals in Dignity. Launched by the Council of Europe Ministers of Foreign Affairs at their 118th Ministerial Session. Strasbourg, 7 May.
- Hałas, E. (2008). Issues of Social Memory and their Challenges in the Global Age. *Time & Society*, 17, 103-118.
- Hobsbawm, E. J. (1992). Ethnicity and Nationalism in Europe Today. *Anthropology Today*, 8, 1, 4-13.
- Horowitz, D. L. (2000). *Ethnic groups in conflict*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Karaulov, Y. N. (2000). Indicators of national mentality in the associative-verbal network. Language consciousness and the image of the world, pp. 191-206. M.: Institute of Linguistic RAS.
- Makarova, E. D. (2010). The image of the administrative and political elite through the eyes of the population of the Republic of Tatarstan. The magazine "Governance", 3, 97-101.
- New day (2014). Inter-ethnic tensions in society will grow, and the geography of conflicts will expand. Retrieved on 15.06.2017 from <http://newdaynews.ru/moskow/493245.html>
- Ricoeur, P. (2000). *La mémoire. l'histoire, l'oubli*. Paris: Éditions du Seuil.
- Shils, E. (1982). *The Constitution of Society*. Chicago, IL: The University of Chicago Press.
- Ufimtseva, N. V. (2011). *Language consciousness: dynamics and variability*. M.: Institute of Linguistic RAS.
- Zamaletdinov, R. R.; Karabulatova, I. S.; Yarmakeev, I. E. & Ermakova, E. N. (2014). Linguo-Propaedeutics of Ethnic Conflicts as a Basis for Stability in Complex Polyethnic Regions. *Asian Social Science*, 10(20), 164-173.